A History of Catholic Education in Scotland

Dr Mary McHugh DSS BA MLitt PhD LLM FSAScot RMARA

1. Education Before the 1872 Act

The influx of large numbers of Irish migrants in the nineteenth-century created a need, if not yet a demand, for the development of educational provision. In Scotland, this need was recognised and accepted by leaders of the Catholic community, both clerical and lay, including Bishop Andrew Scott and Robert Monteith of Carstairs.

Some financial assistance was disbursed through the Committee of the Privy Council on Education, which was constituted in 1839 to superintend the distribution, in both England and Scotland, of the system of government grants introduced respectively in 1833, and 1834, previously. From 1840, these grants were conditional upon government inspection which was denominational in character. Thus, Catholic schools in receipt of grants would be examined by a Catholic Inspector. However, only in 1847, was the Catholic Poor Schools Committee set up by the English Bishops to negotiate with the government for a share in these grants. Not until 1848 were Catholic schools permitted to receive any of the £100,000 annual government grant.

Though the Western District of Scotland did not join the Catholic Poor Schools Committee until 1856, St. Mary's school, Calton, had received government aid and come under inspection as early as 1851. Pupil-teachers there were apprenticed and a grant for books was received. In the following year, the schools attached to St. Andrew's and St. Mungo's also came under inspection, and by 1857 all fourteen Catholic parochial schools of Glasgow were in receipt of grant aid. The purposes for which such grants could be applied had been gradually extended over time. They could be used, as in St. Mary's, to maintain the pupil-teacher system and to purchase school equipment, or, alternatively, devoted to building more schools, encouraging teacher training, or maintaining staff housing.

State finance however, carried with it certain obligations, and the principal duty of Her Majesty's Inspectors was to ensure that the grant was spent wisely and effectively. Inspectors reported to the Committee of [the Privy] Council on matters such as the suitability of school buildings, disposition of desks, books and apparatus, arrangement of classes, forms of discipline, methods of instruction, attainments of staff, and the quality of moral training. With regard to the Catholic schools of Glasgow, most reports stressed the inadequacy of their accommodation and, as a natural consequence, the unsatisfactory nature of much of the instruction.

In addition to the deficiencies in accommodation, the level of instruction offered was also adversely affected by the difficulty, particularly evident in the boys' schools, of obtaining sufficient teachers. Not until the arrival of the Marist Brothers, a teaching order from France in 1858, did matters begin to improve. Father Small of St. Mungo's quickly obtained the services of three of the Brothers to take charge of the parochial school, and the Order also opened its own fee-paying school in a house in Garngad A year later, the introduction into the Western District of the Society of Jesus, led to the establishment of St. Aloysius' College, initially in Charlotte Street, but which later moved to Garnethill in 1866.

The girls' schools had initially been more fortunate, due to the arrival in Scotland of religious orders and institutes, such as the Franciscans and the Sisters of Mercy. In 1846, Father Peter Forbes of St. Mary's, Calton, had visited Franciscan foundations in northern France to invite them to establish a community in Glasgow. Meanwhile, the Sisters of Mercy, again invited by Forbes to Glasgow, took charge both of the girls' orphanage and St. Mary's parochial school. A house was obtained for them in Charlotte Street, but the mother superior preferred that the Sisters should reside with the children in the orphanage. At the suggestion of Bishop Smith, coadjutor of the Western District, the house in Charlotte Street was offered to the Franciscans, who also accepted the direction of the parish schools of St. Andrew's, St. Alphonsus', St. John's, and St. Joseph's, as well as conducting its own convent school.

The impact of the Sisters on standards in the girls' schools was immediate. By 1852, St. Mary's girls' school was found to be in a state of "active progress and organised with judgement and assiduity. However, though the efforts of the religious communities benefited the education of the children in the parochial schools, such improvement was confined to the elementary school subjects of reading, writing, arithmetic, grammar and composition. In 1867, the Argyll Commissioners, commenting on St. Joseph's schools, stated that the achievements of the children in the "three R's" of reading, writing and arithmetic were in all respects equal, and in some instances superior, to those of their non-Catholic counterparts. The teaching of these elementary subjects in Catholic schools generally was described as "most creditable." However, the range of instruction offered was severely limited, and inspectors criticised the concentration on grant-earning dexterity which led to mechanical teaching "that touched neither the intellect nor the heart. Though remarkable results had been achieved with junior classes, the work of the higher classes could not be attempted in the parochial schools. The problem was an ongoing one, for as an inspector wrote as late as the 1890s, such a deficiency arose not through lack of commitment on the part of either teachers or school managers, or from any defect in the inspection system, but "solely from the intellectual defects of a staff who have not received regular and thorough training."

The lack of a Catholic training college in Scotland therefore represented a grave handicap to the development of Catholic education, and this became increasingly evident as moves gathered pace throughout the nineteenth century to improve the qualifications and status of the teaching profession. The intention was eventually to abolish the pupil-teacher system which had been introduced in 1846, and which survived until the introduction of the Junior Student scheme sixty years later. But until that point in time, pupil-teachers served a five-year apprenticeship, and were examined annually.

Pupil-teachers were also expected to provide the main source of supply for the normal school or training college. But as is already apparent, few Catholic students either could, or would, progress, further, even though by 1865 all sixteen Catholic mission schools in Glasgow were under the charge of certificated teachers. Only a small number of Glasgow students proceeded to the three Catholic training colleges which the Catholic Poor School Committee had established in England.

If teacher-training presented one major problem, then an equally pressing difficulty lay in encouraging children to attend school, and in convincing their parents to send them. This difficulty was compounded by the proposed introduction into Scotland of the Revised Code on 4 May 1864. Hitherto, examinations and grants had been arranged by entire schools and classes, but the Revised Code provided for a separate grant for each child. This system, known as "payment by results", could have meant financial ruin for some Catholic schools for it highlighted two of their most pressing problems, the chronically irregular attendance at school of most Catholic children, and the inconsistent level of instruction offered. It was therefore fortunate for the Catholic community that the Revised Code did not immediately come into full operation in Scotland. Until the 1872 Education (Scotland) Act was passed a partially successful compromise was operated, whereby individual examinations were conducted under the Revised Code, but grants continued to be awarded to the class as a whole. This respite was welcome to the Catholic schools as it offered them additional time to achieve a satisfactory performance in the individual examination before their grants actually depended upon it.

By 1870, the Western District, (excluding missions serving the Western Highlands and Islands), recorded accommodation for 11,447 children in its existing school premises. Grants from the Crisis Fund however, enabled the District, between June 1871 and January 1874, to provide an additional 4,398 school places.

Such preparations in anticipation of the introduction of compulsory education do not suggest that Catholic leaders ever seriously considered the possibility of placing their schools under state control. The 1870 Act had already aroused misgivings, some of which were confirmed with the passage of the Education (Scotland) Act in 1872. As in England, School Boards became the local unit of educational administration, to which all parochial and burgh schools would be transferred. Voluntary schools could also, if they so chose, transfer to their local Board. However, Catholic voluntary schools did not avail themselves of this provision, principally because of concern over the religious instruction to be offered in the public schools. Although in Scotland, School Boards were free to approve of Catholic or Protestant instruction in their schools, the fear persisted among the Catholic community that Board schools would not sufficiently promote the interests of religion, thus encouraging the growth of secularism. Only in some parts of the Highlands and Islands, where Catholic School Boards were elected, was Catholic doctrine taught in the schools. Elsewhere the provisions of the 1872 Act, which would have allowed the establishment of specifically Catholic schools, were not put into practice.

By choosing to maintain an independent Catholic sector in education, the episcopate was undertaking a massive financial and administrative burden which was steadily to become more and more onerous. The Catholic community, as ratepayers, had to contribute towards the maintenance of the Board schools, while their own establishments were not to be entitled to rate aid. In addition, they had also to pay for the expansion and upkeep of a distinctive Catholic sector. This double payment seemed to be accepted, but Catholics continued to campaign for denominational schools to receive support from both Parliamentary Grants and local rate aid, in exactly the same manner as the public schools. The need for such rate aid would become ever more apparent as Catholic schools, with fewer resources than their Board counterparts, attempted to maintain their legal obligations in the face of improving educational standards and increasing expectations.

2. 1872-1918

As Archbishop Eyre had expected, the 1872 Education (Scotland) Act introduced compulsory education for all children aged from five to thirteen years. However, although Catholic school attendance rates improved in the decade following the passage of the 1872 Act, their relatively low level, coupled with a continued pattern of irregular attendance, undoubtedly lost Catholic schools some of the money available in government grants. Only those children with at least 250 attendances could be examined in the various Standards, an attainment achieved by only 59% of children on Catholic school rolls in the Western Province.

Head-Teachers devised various means of encouraging children to attend school. In St. Mary's RC School, Calton, the one-day a week visit of the school board officers was considered to be "largely ineffectual," and, as in St. Francis, alternative methods of encouragement were adopted. The use of footballs to kick in the yard before school was introduced to promote good timekeeping, and football matches for the perfect attenders with prizes for the winning teams also proved effective. More importantly, in an attempt to combat poverty and the related effects of "inclement weather" on attendances, the headmaster and staff supplied boots and clothes to those who lacked them. By the 1890s, these various efforts seemed to be achieving the desired result, with attendances throughout the Province having risen by just under 10% to an average of 78.3%, with the greatest improvement taking place in the city suburbs and in Lanarkshire.95 Improvement was maintained during subsequent decades, and by 1912, 89% of children on the school rolls of the Province were in attendance at classes, a proportion which compared favourably with that for Scotland as a whole.

The maintenance of their grant-earning, "efficient", status therefore confronted Catholic schools with a series of sometimes contradictory problems. Increased attendances could mean a higher level of grant but, by the same token, that grant was also dependent upon the existence of satisfactory accommodation, the provision of which inevitably entailed additional expenditure. Greater numbers of qualified teachers were also required. In this context it might be argued that the availability of religious orders dedicated to education, like the Jesuits, the Marists, the Franciscans and the Sisters of Mercy, was both beneficial and yet retrograde, for their very presence postponed for the Church the reality of having to build up a more efficient body of lay teachers. The continued intensive employment of pupil-teachers became one of the hallmarks of the Catholic elementary school sector.

Such considerations further emphasised the urgent necessity of establishing a Catholic teacher-training college in Scotland. In order to staff the new college, Archbishop Eyre had opened negotiations with the Mother House of the Notre Dame Congregation at Namur in Belgium, whose Sisters already ran, and taught in, the Mount Pleasant Training College in Liverpool. As early as June 1893, Sister Mary of St. Philip, Principal of Mount Pleasant, paid exploratory visits both to Glasgow and Edinburgh, and advised that the Dowanhill district of the former city was the most suitable area in which to establish the college, as it was close, not only to the university, but also to a number of schools suitable for the students' teaching practice.

In spite of Archbishop Eyre's over-optimistic hopes that the college would be functioning by January 1894, it was not until 20 August that the first nuns arrived - Sister Philippine of the Cross and Sister Teresa of the Nativity, Sister Julie de St. Therese, and the principal, Sister Mary of St. Wilfrid (Mary Adela Lescher). The formal opening did not take place until 14 January 1895. The first Roman Catholic teachers to be trained in Scotland qualified in June 1896. In 1897, the college opened its own higher grade practising school, with twenty-four children and four staff, two being pupil-teachers. The creation of such a school was essential to the effectiveness of the college by helping to ensure a readily available source of future students, at a time when post-elementary schools in the Archdiocese numbered eleven, educating only 827 pupils.

The movement towards the more thorough academic training of intending teachers, only served to highlight the continued inadequacy of Catholic secondary provision. In Dunbartonshire, Notre Dame High School for Girls, Dumbarton, opened in 1911, represented the only post-elementary foundation in the county until 1920 when St. Patrick's High School for Boys was opened in the same town. Lanarkshire was more fortunate, with a department for secondary education opening in St. Augustine's, Langloan, on 6 August 1894. A second secondary department attached to Our Lady of Good Aid School, Motherwell, opened in 1895.

The emphasis in Catholic educational provision therefore, prior to 1918, was mainly directed towards the development of the elementary, or primary, sector. To this end, most of the available resources were devoted. In spite of all efforts to maintain efficient education however, the Catholic system, by the early twentieth-century was showing increasing signs of strain. Yet if some of the most persistent problems confronting Catholic education were those of accommodation, and of teacher training and supply, a closely related difficulty was that of finance. Money was necessary, not only to provide and maintain school buildings and equipment, but also to pay salaries. However, teaching in Catholic schools was not a particularly remunerative occupation. In 1904, when the average salary for Board school masters amounted to about £150 per year, Roman Catholic male teachers were paid only £107.155. The average Board salary for women, who were paid less than men in comparable posts, was £75.17.5.156. The desire for greater parity with their Board school colleagues was expressed by the membership of the West of Scotland Catholic Teachers' Association at its General Meeting in December 1903, when they asked for length of service and qualifications to be taken into account in determining salary levels, and drew up an amended scale of salaries. Such inequalities gave rise to frustration which was made evident in 1914 when the National Council of the Scottish Catholic Teachers' Federation expressed its belief that Catholic salaries could have been improved, and voiced their disappointment that this had not been achieved.

Catholic teachers also desired that, in the matter of superannuation and pension provision for their eventual retirement, they should receive "equitable treatment” in comparison with their colleagues in state schools. Such a scheme had been introduced for elementary teachers in Board schools in 1898, and was extended ten years later to cover all Scottish schools. In an address to the teachers of the Archdiocese as early as 1889, Archbishop Eyre commented that "the possibility of some scheme for giving retiring pensions" would have to be considered, but as late as 1907 Charles McKay, Secretary of the West of Scotland Catholic Teachers' Association, still deemed it necessary to urge the Bishops of Scotland to put forward more strongly the claims of Catholic teachers.

Eyre himself, in his address to the teachers, had admitted that, though desirable, pension provision was closely connected "with the question of our [Catholic] share of the rates." It was probably the knowledge of this connection which caused the Teachers' Association in 1903 to declare its support for rate aid to be made available to Catholic schools. Catholic teachers were anxious to work in harmony with their school managers. But, as they explained to Monsignor Brown, the Apostolic Visitor in 1917, their salaries did not even constitute a living wage.

The goodwill of the teachers was essential, for on them fell the responsibility of much of the religious instruction and training of Catholic children. They prepared their pupils for the regular visits of the Diocesan Religious Inspector, and for the reception of the sacraments. Particular attention was paid to the learning of the prayers and text of the catechism. In order to encourage and acknowledge "industry and efficiency in giving religious instruction," the Catholic Poor School Committee had instituted grants of honour to teachers in schools recommended by the Diocesan Inspector. Pupil-teachers were also required to present themselves for the written religious examinations set by the Committee, although a complete attendance of the pupil-teachers of the Archdiocese was not always secured. Even after the abolition of the pupil-teacher system itself, a formal religious examination for intending Catholic teachers continued to be set until as late as the mid-twentieth century. The reports of the Diocesan Inspectors over the years demonstrate that the standards of religious instruction provided by the teachers were very rarely less than satisfactory, and in the majority of schools were deemed to be either "very good" or "excellent."

However, the cumulative frustration and resentment among teachers in the first decades of the twentieth century, coupled with the increasingly serious financial position of the Archdiocese in the first two decades of the twentieth-century, made it imperative to find a permanent, and stable, solution to the difficulties confronting Catholic voluntary schools. Although the framework for such a solution was not obtained until the Education (Scotland) Act of 1918, the reality of the situation had already been recognized two decades earlier. When it made application for rate aid in 1896, the Diocesan Education Board stated its willingness to transfer Catholic schools to the local School Boards providing that the Church retained its ownership of the school buildings, together with continued control over staff appointments and school management.

The Catholic case for rate aid found clear expression in a Report, dated 27 February 1896, by the Diocesan Education Board's sub-committee on Voluntary schemes. That document claimed that since Catholics were bearing a proportional share with the School Boards in the task of national education they were entitled to claim a proportionate share of public support. This claim was reiterated two months later, in the Memorandum submitted by Canon Cameron on behalf of the Diocesan Education Board to the Scotch Education Department. The Memorandum restated the Catholic position that the maintenance of their schools was a matter of conscience, and criticised the label "voluntary" which was attached to them. In Cameron's view the Church had, on grounds of conscience, no option but to remain outwith the national system. Therefore, Catholic children and parents should not, as a result of that decision, be placed at a disadvantage when compared with the provision made for the rest of the country. Rate aid would enable Catholic schools to improve the accommodation and education presently provided while, at the same time, removing a double burden of payment from the Catholic community.

Having admitted the need for rate aid, and having conceded the corresponding principle of transfer, a permanent solution to the financial problems confronting the Catholic voluntary schools became a possibility. However, the 1918 Act was preceded by many false dawns. Discussions and counter-proposals continued throughout the years of the First World War. In July 1914, a second deputation from the Catholic Education Committee met Mr. McKinnon Wood, Secretary of State for Scotland, to lay before him Catholic grievances and ask for further aid. The difficulty over grants brought into sharper focus the need for an agreement on terms of transfer for the voluntary schools, a need which became more urgent when further educational reforms were proposed. In March 1917 Sir John Struthers, Secretary of the Scottish Education Department, drafted a Memorandum for Robert Munro, the Secretary of State, in which he argued the need for an Education (Scotland) Bill to remedy some of the more apparent weaknesses in Scotland's educational structure. The main lines of advance would be to improve the remuneration and status of teachers, especially those in secondary schools, and to forge closer links between the various recognized stages of education, from the primary school to university. Struthers also asserted that those children among the school population educated in the voluntary sector were effectively deprived of equal educational opportunity. When Munro, in November 1917, explained the purpose of his Bill to the Cabinet, he repeated Struthers' claim, and made particular reference to the educational disadvantage suffered, due to lack of resources, by Catholic children. But since, in his view, a more generous provision of state aid to denominational schools than to public schools would not be tolerated by public opinion, he preferred that these schools should be transferred to public control with safeguards for the retention of their denominational character.

Within most of the Catholic community in Scotland, the Bill received a cautious welcome. Catholic concerns over safeguards focused on four main areas: the control of religious instruction, representation on School Management Committees, the appointment and dismissal of teachers, and the provision of new schools. Compromise on most points was however necessary. The Government refused to accept any amendment which might have limited the freedom of choice of the new education authorities to make an appointment from the Catholic applicants for any post. As a result, members of religious orders were to have no special privileges, and appointments were to be left to the good sense of the authorities. On the issue of new schools, discussions centred around two related points; whether the State would provide all stages of education for Catholic children or, if the Catholic community continued to provide their own new schools, whether the new authorities would be compelled to subsequently accept such schools for transfer. In the end, the wording of the Bill on this point remained obscure, and its interpretation was not defined until a dispute arose in 1928 over the Catholic school in Bonnybridge. On the issue of preserving the religious character of the schools however, agreement was more easily reached. Provision was made for the appointment of a supervisor of religious instruction, who was to possess right of entry to the individual schools at those hours legally set aside for religious instruction. Facilities were also to be granted for the holding of religious examinations. The supervisor however, could not object to the use of certain textbooks, the choice of which was the responsibility of the education authority.

A solution to the voluntary schools’ problem was now in sight. Monsignor Brown, the Apostolic Visitor urged the Catholic community to accept the Bill, for "...if we incur the odium of wrecking this Bill we handicap ourselves in every effort to induce another Government to pass one even as good for us." Even so, at this late stage, the passage of the Bill was threatened when the Cathedral Chapter and senior priests of the Archdiocese of Glasgow renewed their demands, including that school managers should retain control over the appointment and dismissal of teachers. Such demands caused Brown great concern, for he believed that if the Catholic community was seen to be divided about the Bill, then the clause dealing with voluntary schools might have been dropped, with the rest of the Bill being passed. Only the intervention of the Holy See, which insisted that the majority decision of Bishops, clergy and laity to accept the Bill be upheld, averted the danger, and allowed Monsignor Brown to signify to Munro the Catholic community's acceptance of the Bill; which received the Royal Assent on 21 November 1918.

CATHOLIC EDUCATION IN THE WEST OF SCOTLAND
3.1918-1945

The passage of the 1918 Education (Scotland) Act marked as much of a beginning as it did an ending, for it still remained to be seen how it would operate in practice, and what would be its impact on the Catholic community. Certain benefits accrued almost immediately, Catholic teachers receiving parity of salary with their colleagues in the state system. The laity too, might reasonably have hoped for some easing of their double financial burden. However, such hopes only gradually saw fulfilment for, in the early years of the Act's operation, many Glasgow clergy remained unconvinced as to its possible benefits for the Catholic community, and their misgivings emerged once more in the discussions over the method by which the schools should be transferred to the new Education Authorities.

Two alternative methods of transfer were available - either to sell the schools outright, or to lease them for an agreed period in exchange for rental income. The majority of members of the Catholic Education Council for Scotland, though prepared to accept leasing as an interim arrangement, favoured the sale of Catholic schools to the new authorities. Lord Skerrington supported sale as a general policy, and pointed out that the continued ownership of ageing school buildings could not be of benefit to the Catholics of Scotland. His views were echoed by Bishop Donald Martin of Argyll and the Isles.

Such opinions as to the merits of sale were not shared by Monsignor John Ritchie of Glasgow, who expressed his disapproval both to the Catholic Education Council itself, and directly to Monsignor Brown. Ritchie stated that the Archdiocesan Schools Transfer Board established in January 1919 to transact, and advise the Archbishop, on all business connected with the transfer of schools to the national system, was very largely, in fact predominantly, in favour of leasing. Indeed, by November of the same year, leasing agreements had been concluded covering thirty-seven schools in the City of Glasgow, twelve in Dunbartonshire, thirty-nine in Lanarkshire and twenty-one in Renfrewshire. By the same date, a total of £15,651.17s.10d. in rental income had been received.

With the exception of rents paid directly to four schools owned and managed by religious orders - St. Mungo's, Notre Dame, the Convent of Mercy and Charlotte Street - the Schools Transfer Board, and from 1920 onwards successive Diocesan Education Boards were the normal recipients of such income, which formed the basis of a charitable trust for educational purposes. Among such purposes was the continued provision of school buildings for, unconvinced that any potential savings in cost were sufficient to outweigh the perceived danger of secularism, the Archdiocese of Glasgow had, in 1919, taken the decision to continue, as and when necessary, to construct all new schools and extensions, for both elementary and higher grade pupils, from its own resources. Such schools would, on completion, be leased to the appropriate education authority.

However, this policy relied on two, as yet untested, assumptions: firstly, that the 1918 Act had indeed given to the Church the right to identify and remedy deficiencies in Catholic school provision, and secondly, that the various education authorities were obliged to accept such schools for transfer. When Lord Murray in 1928, giving judgement in the Bonnybridge case, ruled that Catholic schools established after the passage of the 1918 Act could be offered for transfer to the appropriate education authority, which must accept them at a fair price, the school building policy of the Archdiocese of Glasgow appeared to have been vindicated. However, in purely practical terms, the decision of 1919 only served to maintain an unnecessary financial burden upon the Catholic community, a difficulty apparently evident to the Schools Transfer Board which had "all along been alive to the seriousness of the burdens entailed by leasing, and consequently building”. Even so, one member of the Board, Canon Hugh Kelly of Dumbarton continued to express his dismay at the policy adopted. Kelly, like Lord Skerrington and Bishop Martin, favoured the outright sale of Catholic schools, and argued that the policy of leasing and building was totally impractical. In Kelly's view, the safeguards provided by the 1918 Act were perfectly sufficient, and therefore to retain the proprietorship of the buildings was of little consequence, while to go on building was simply to continue "hugging our chains". He also believed that a policy of sale would benefit the relationship between children, teachers and clergy, by allowing the priest to cease being a manager, and become to the school "a Pastor only."

Without doubt though, Canon Kelly's most cogent arguments concerned the bleak financial outlook. From figures supplied by the School Managers, he estimated that the value of Catholic school property was in the range of £700,000 to £1 million, and taking the Archdiocese as a whole, his assessment may well have been correct for the Glasgow city schools alone had been independently valued at £355,350.215. Such a sum would earn more for the Church in investments than a policy of leasing and renting ever could. Selling the schools would provide financial security, a greater return, and a capital fund should the 1918 Act ever break down. Finally, as Lord Skerrington had pointed out, the Church would be rid of old school buildings which were becoming more of a liability than an asset. Selling the schools would not only relieve the financial burden on the Archdiocese, it would also transfer completely to local authorities the task of finding solutions to such problems as inadequate and overcrowded school buildings.

With the income provided from selling and leasing the school buildings, the church also attempted to improve the supply of Catholic teachers by disbursing grants to students in training for the teaching profession. Such grants took the form of an interest-free loan to cover the whole, or part, of the cost of a course at the University or Training College, and were aimed particularly at those who without such assistance, would be unable to complete their studies. Though repayment of such loans was implied, in practice this condition was never enforced. Nor were legal proceedings initially instituted against default. It was reluctantly accepted the fact that some loan-grants would prove to be irrecoverable, and few applicants were ever refused. These grants were particularly important in enabling intending primary school teachers to pursue their chosen career, for such individuals were otherwise dependent upon inadequate Corporation bursaries. Prospective secondary teachers were more fortunate for, as university students, they were also eligible to apply for Carnegie grants to finance their degree studies.

As Canon Kelly had foreseen, the cumulative effect of the school building policy gradually forced Catholic leaders in the west of Scotland to accept that the only viable future for Catholic education lay in complete financial integration with the state sector. In January 1927 Archbishop Mackintosh had informed the Diocesan Education Board that "from now onward, instead of letting its schools to the various education authorities, the Archdiocese, as the leases now in force expire, will negotiate with those authorities for the sale of the said schools." Nevertheless, "it must not be a sale at any price, but a sale to be arranged by equitable negotiation or arbitration." By September 1927, discussions had been entered into with the Glasgow Education Authority concerning the sale of Catholic schools within its area. Certain schools however, including the convent schools and St. Mungo's Academy were excluded from the negotiations as the Diocesan Education Board "had no control over these." Also excluded were those schools where a school and church were combined in one building. Such premises would continue to be leased by the authority on an annual basis.

On 15 May 1928, the sale of the Archdiocesan-owned schools within the city of Glasgow to the Education Authority came into effect. However, in September of the same year similar offers of sale previously made to the other education authorities were withdrawn, and the Diocesan Education Board instead successfully proposed that a one-year lease should be negotiated. The proposed reform of Local Government, and the considerations raised by the Bonnybridge case, made it necessary to proceed with caution. Even greater misgivings were aroused when in 1929-30 the Local Government (Scotland) Act replaced the former authorities with Statutory Committees of County, or Burgh, Councils on which minorities were to be represented by co-opted members. Glasgow Corporation in drawing up its required scheme for the constitution of an Education Committee, proposed that Catholic representation on its Committee should be limited to one individual. In reality however, three of the Councils - Glasgow, Dunbartonshire, and Renfrewshire - included two Catholic representatives, while Lanarkshire accepted three. A conscious effort was also made by the Diocesan Education Board to ensure that one such representative in each county was a lay person.

After 1929, the Board continued to proceed cautiously with regard to the ownership of diocesan schools, for although the policy of sale was not totally abandoned, it was considerably delayed and tended to become somewhat piecemeal. Though intimation had been given to Lanarkshire county council in September 1930 of the Board's willingness to sell the schools serving Cleland, Baillieston and St. Patrick's Coatbridge, a further five schools - at Uddingston, Bothwell, Newmains, Larkhall, and New Stevenston - were not sold until January 1937. In Renfrewshire and Dunbartonshire leasing agreements persisted, though in October 1936 the county clerk of Renfrewshire wrote to the Diocesan Education Board requesting terms of sale. In March 1938, his counterpart in Dunbartonshire made a similar approach, and by January 1939 valuations in respect of six schools had been prepared. However, the advent of war eight months later effectively thwarted these negotiations for in January 1940 Dunbartonshire County Council withdrew from the sale, primarily because of wartime restrictions on capital expenditure. Leases were instead continued for a further five years.

Though the eventual sale of the Catholic schools within the Archdiocese was therefore spread over a considerable period of time, the financial impracticality of building schools from its own resources had earlier been acknowledged. Any lasting solution to the problems of overcrowding, and the replacement of inadequate school buildings involved a sustained injection of capital expenditure which the Church itself could not hope to meet. Further extension of Catholic post-primary provision also required a similar commitment of resources. However, as the rental income received from leasing was evidently "below the cost of the inadequate building programme already carried out or under way," the necessary commitment could clearly not be forthcoming. Nor at a time when "industry is depressed and unemployment rampant" could Catholic congregations continue to bear such a financial burden. As a result, during the course of 1928-29, Archbishop Mackintosh informed the various authorities that the Church "could not for the future undertake the provision of new school accommodation." The outlay involved in building new primary schools had severely strained the finances of some missions/parishes, which found themselves unable to meet the interest on the debt incurred. In response, the Diocesan Education Board resolved in March 1931 to refund to these missions/parishes one half of the money spent on the building of schools. If, even after receiving this relief, any mission/parish was still in difficulty, interest on the remaining half of the school burden [would] be met by the Board, in whole or in part, as long as the Archbishop thought it necessary.

In waiving its right to build, the Archdiocese doubtless hoped that the local authorities, as in the case of Greenock, would be able to effect a more rapid improvement in Catholic school provision and ease overcrowding, particularly in the post-primary sector. To some extent such hopes were realised. In Glasgow, between 1936-1939, two senior, and three junior, secondaries were established. The opening of Holyrood senior secondary in 1936 to serve the south side of the city had a noticeable, and immediate, effect upon St. Mungo's Academy where the numbers attempting the qualifying examination for entrance fell by almost one-third (31%). In Lanarkshire after 1928, two new junior secondaries were opened. Dunbartonshire however, was relatively less well served, for although a new building was provided in 1931 to house St. Ninian's in Kirkintilloch, the absence of any attempt to make senior secondary schooling available in Clydebank was a notable omission.

The trade depression of the 1930s led to a period of retrenchment in education from which the Catholic community was not wholly immune. Teachers were forced to accept cuts in salary as an alternative to unemployment, while only those students obtaining the best teaching marks during their college course were able to secure employment. Opportunities to enter the profession were also curtailed. Economic difficulties also led Glasgow Corporation in 1934 to refuse to provide separate school accommodation for the Catholic community in the Cardonald district of the city "which had increased greatly in population...on account of housing developments.". Though "a considerable number” of Catholic families had moved into the area the number of children was initially deemed insufficient to merit their own school. Instead, Catholic pupils were accommodated in Craigton Public School where separate Catholic classes were formed, with Catholic teachers. In effect, the Corporation's Education Committee wished to maximise the use of its school buildings, thereby to avoid incurring unnecessary expenditure. As it appeared that an education authority could not be forced to build a denominational school under the terms of the 1918 Act, Glasgow availed itself of the continuing opportunity to erect new school buildings under the Act of 1872, thus retaining “a liberty to change their character as future circumstances might suggest." Under the 1872 Act, it was possible for two schools to operate in one building. The Diocesan Education Board at first made no objection to this arrangement, for so long as Catholic children occupied any such building the Corporation treated it "for all other purposes” as being a school under the 1918 Act. Similarly, the Board did not demur when, in times of emergency, non-Catholic children had to share a building allocated to the Catholic community. However, the campaign waged by the Scottish Protestant League, under its leader Alexander Ratcliffe, caused considerable anxiety to the Church authorities. Ratcliffe's aim at the Municipal elections in 1934 was to unseat the Socialists who supported the 1918 Act; as he hoped, through both local and Parliamentary action, to "bring down the rates and end the present shameful two-fold sectarian school system which is burdening the rates and taxes." Concerned, both by Ratcliffe's activities, and by Glasgow's clear intent to continue to build using the provisions of the 1872 Act, the Diocesan Education Board approached the Scottish Education Department for guidance. Bishop Brown of Pella, the former Apostolic Visitor, also intervened. In response, the Department suggested that the provision of schools under the 1872 Act could tend "to keep the Protestant objectors to such schools quiet," and so help the Catholic view, though it was doubtful if this sufficiently compensated for the absence of legal safeguards. The whole problem, it was admitted, "is very difficult and has the seeds of trouble."

By 1943, the trouble anticipated by the Department had not arisen. The eighteen schools in Scotland built under the 1872 Act, the majority of them in Glasgow, continued to be administered under the 1918 Act. However, as Archbishop McDonald of Edinburgh pointed out, the fact that no difficulties had yet occurred did not imply that the problem had been solved. Schools erected under the 1872 Act simply did not enjoy the protection and benefits for religious belief and character of the 1918 Act, and, in McDonald's opinion, the "seriousness of the position" if difficulties later arose, was readily apparent. Of particular concern was the position of the supervisors of religious instruction, authority for whose appointment was provided only in the 1918 Act. It was therefore feared that in those schools built under the 1872 Act, education committees could at any time appoint non-Catholic teachers, while refusing to appoint supervisors of religious instruction, as the 1872 Act had made no such provision.

The evident concern over the position of the supervisors of religious instruction, reflected the desire of the Catholic authorities to maintain the religious character of their schools. This desire was also demonstrated in other ways, most notably in the requirements for intending teachers who had to be approved by the appropriate diocesan authority with regard to "religious belief and character." In order to qualify for such recognition, in the form of the Religious Certificate of Approval, male students were required to reside in St. Kentigern's Hostel during their course of studies at Jordanhill, while female students were required to train in either of the two Catholic teacher-training colleges at Craiglockhart in Edinburgh, or at Dowanhill. Both groups of students had also to sit a second formal Religious Examination, having already passed the Prospective Teachers' Examination in their final year of secondary schooling. The Hostel system however, did not prove to be a success, and as early as June 1923 the Marist Brother in charge informed the Diocesan Education Board that the students' attitude was "one of continuous protest" and advised that residence should become optional. Nevertheless, the Board would not be dissuaded from its desire to provide an adequate hostel for men students who proposed to become teachers, and it continued to uphold as late as 1927, its belief in the benefits to be derived from some period of hostel residence, possibly during students' postgraduate year at Jordanhill. The Religious Certificate of Approval however, proved to be a more permanent feature, though it was partly dependent for its effectiveness on the co-operation of the various education committees. Not all committees were consistent in ensuring that candidates for teaching posts possessed the required qualification, and in February 1941 the Board specifically noted that five teachers teaching in Renfrewshire did not possess the religious certificate.

The outbreak of the Second World War in fact forced the Archdiocese to relax some of its regulations.

When the schools re-opened after the summer vacation in 1939 their first priority was to complete evacuation arrangements. St. Mungo's Academy was open all day on Saturday and Sunday 26 and 27 August "to provide information and take the names of the boys who were leaving the city." On being notified that evacuation would take place between 1-3 September, the school closed at once, and those pupils being evacuated were instructed to report to their assembly points - the Catholic primary schools in their neighbourhood. The remaining pupils were told to stay at home until further notice. From the nearby school of St. Mary's, Calton, about 500 children were also evacuated, to Cults in Aberdeenshire.

However, the expected raids did not immediately materialise. Furthermore, as the period of the "phoney war" became more protracted, groups of evacuees began to return to the major cities, and the need to provide a closer approximation to peacetime educational facilities became more acute. Though some Glasgow schools, like St. Mungo's, had re-opened by the end of October 1939, the absence of air-raid shelters meant that attendance could only be on a voluntary basis, and confined to limited numbers, to minimise risks in the event of bombing. Inevitably therefore, only part-time education was initially possible. In St. Mary's in December 1939, classes of twenty pupils, each class on a weekly timetable of five hours, were receiving instruction. However, by April 1940 school attendance, on a part-time basis only, was once more made compulsory throughout the city. Full-time provision was only gradually re-introduced, but seems to have been effective in many schools, both primary and secondary, by Easter 1942.

Such disruption of school routine was further compounded by staffing difficulties, and by pressure on available accommodation. Evacuation itself could contribute to staff shortages, as in St. Mary's, Calton, where the school was initially able to operate only by drawing on the services of "those teachers who could be spared" from the evacuation point at Cults, Aberdeenshire. In addition, many young teachers went almost immediately to the Services or into "war work." In August 1939, two members of staff from the science department at St. Mungo's were assigned for part-time service in the city analyst's offices to aid in the task of gas detection, and a rota of attendance covering the whole science staff was later prepared. Moreover, during the course of the war, teachers from the school joined the forces. As teaching was a reserved occupation only for those aged thirty-five and over, there occurred, as in the First World War, a shortage of qualified male teachers. The operation of the call-up system led to a constant turnover in school staffs. The availability of school places, too, was restricted, both by military requirements, and the effect of air raids. Within a year of the outbreak of war, ninety-four schools in Scotland were wholly, and 199 partly, occupied for military purposes, while others suffered considerable damage from air raids, resulting in the need to obtain temporary accommodation. After the Clydebank Blitz of March 1941, many schools were left either demolished or useless, and some Catholic pupils from the town were evacuated to attend St. Ninian's High School, Kirkintilloch, where the roll increased rapidly. In Dalmuir, with the "public" school out of commission, Dunbartonshire County Council requested permission from the diocesan authorities to house temporarily these pupils in St. Stephen's RC School.

Even when places were available, war-time exigencies exerted a continued influence over the pattern of school life. Teachers' summer holidays were curtailed so that their fire-watching duties could be maintained all year round; and schools re-opened earlier than normal to allow "a further three weeks of closed doors in the autumn" so that pupils could assist in bringing in the grain and potato harvests. Many schools also maintained allotments. Within the classroom itself, teaching could be further interrupted, as in St. Mungo's, by the periodic suspension of normal study to allow senior pupils to prepare ration books and identity cards for distribution.

As a result of the war, it proved impossible to maintain educational standards and attainment. The Leaving Certificate had to be organised under emergency arrangements, and temporarily ceased to be a national examination, with papers instead being set by a local panel and corrected under the supervision of a regional board of assessors composed of selected headmasters, principal teachers, and inspectors. The Certificate became unquestionably easier to obtain. The Scottish Education Department in 1947, while acknowledging the efforts made by teachers during the war years, commented that at the primary stage, "proficiency in written composition, arithmetic and the power to comprehend what is read," had not yet returned to pre-war levels.

4. 1945-62

Even prior to the end of the war however, forward planning for educational reconstruction and future requirements was being undertaken. The effect of the war on home life, with fathers in the forces and mothers at work, focussed attention on the need to extend social assistance and welfare arrangements in the schools, and on making nursery provision available for pre-school children. Such concerns found expression in the 1945 Education (Scotland) Act which provided for free milk, meals, and medical inspection for all children, while nursery schools could be established in those areas "where there was sufficient demand." Catholic leaders accepted that "social conditions have arisen and may continue which may render it imperative or at least highly desirable to send their children to school before the age of five." Nevertheless, the Hierarchy made clear its desire that separate nursery provision, where numbers were sufficient, should be made for Catholic children.

In reality however, the Hierarchy's fears were premature, for, in the decades after 1945, nursery schools were destined to remain an underdeveloped sector of education, with other, more immediately urgent, problems claiming the attention of the various authorities. The damage, and destruction, to school buildings caused by the war, contributed to a continued shortage of school places; a shortage which was further emphasized when a school leaving age of fifteen became effective in 1947. The raising of the leaving age was expected to add about 60,000 pupils to school rolls, and, as a result most authorities accepted the Scottish Education Department's offer to provide additional classrooms in the form of hutted buildings. In addition, as wartime conditions had effectively denuded both the schools, and the training colleges, of their male students, sufficient teachers were not available. For this reason, the 1945 Act abolished the marriage disqualification for women teachers, and a succession of special schemes sought to attract entrants into the teaching profession. The temporary Emergency Training Scheme, was superseded in 1951 by the Special Recruitment Scheme which offered financial assistance to individuals following other occupations who were prepared to train as teachers.

Though these twin problems of school accommodation and teacher supply were common to both Catholic and non-Catholic schools, their persistence pressed particularly heavily upon the former, for the inter-war attempts by both diocesan and public authorities to effect some improvement in these areas had already been constrained by economic depression. For example, in 1945, there was still no higher grade school in Clydebank to serve the Catholic communities of Yoker, Clydebank, Dalmuir, Old Kilpatrick, Duntocher, and Hardgate. Instead, 126 children - sixty-eight girls and fifty-eight boys - travelled respectively to Notre Dame, and St. Patrick's, High Schools in Dumbarton, while others attended local non-Catholic schools. The Diocesan Education Board noted with some concern the evident reluctance of parents to send their children to Dumbarton due to the distance involved.

The secondary department of Our Holy Redeemer's Clydebank, however, was not replaced until 1970. In that year, St. Andrew's High opened as a comprehensive school offering a full five-six-year secondary course; though St. Columba's Secondary, incorporating the Junior Secondary department of St. Mary's, Duntocher, had already opened nine years previously in 1961. Improvements in secondary provision and accommodation in the town therefore occurred only gradually, a process which was reflected throughout the Western Province. In 1947, the Scottish Education Department admitted that progress in school building was disappointingly slow, and the continuation of building restrictions and the licensing system until 1954 meant that, as in the case of new churches, any necessary expansion was limited due to a shortage of materials. No new, purpose-built Catholic secondary was built anywhere in the Province until the opening of St. Augustine's in the Milton district of Glasgow in 1954.

In the mid-1950s, and subsequently, education authorities continued to be actively engaged in tackling the difficulties of providing accommodation. The higher birth-rate of the post-war era, combined with a decline in infant mortality, meant a continued pressure on school places, a pressure which was exacerbated by a reduction in the permissible size of classes. The Day Schools (Scotland) Code of 1950 specified class maxima of forty-five in the primary school, forty in the first three years of secondary education, and thirty thereafter. Population movements into new housing areas also created a demand for new school buildings and additional places.

By the early 1960s, some education authorities had made considerable progress in the provision of new schools. Cranhill comprehensive school for example, opened at the end of 1960, was the seventy-fifth new school in Glasgow since the war. New schools, however, took time to plan and erect, and education authorities, now legally required to provide "secondary education for all," initially attempted to meet their obligations by adapting and recategorising existing buildings. In Glasgow, advanced division centres, and primary schools containing sizeable advanced division classes continued to be upgraded to junior secondary status. Similarly, outwith the city, the extension to St. Mary's School, Whifflet, began an independent existence as St. Edmund's Junior Secondary in 1948; although in Port Glasgow, St. John's functioned as both a primary and junior secondary school until 1960.

The division of post-primary schooling into a system of senior and junior secondaries, was first introduced in the Education (Scotland) Act of 1936, but its full implementation had been delayed by the outbreak of war. As well as attempting therefore, to remedy the deficiencies caused by the war, education authorities had also to confront the problems posed by secondary reorganisation. The purpose and goals of the senior secondary were relatively well-defined, with its pupils being prepared for the Leaving Certificate examinations. By contrast, the junior secondary, attended by the bulk of the population, offered no certificate to its pupils on completion of their three-year course. This bipartite system however, based on the academic selection of pupils at the end of their primary school courses, raised fundamental questions as to the nature of secondary education, particularly when the Advisory Council in 1947 had made clear that the non-certificate child should not be regarded as inferior to his more intellectually gifted counterpart. Indeed, by the mid-1950s when education authorities were better able to plan for future requirements, the effectiveness of the bipartite system was already being questioned. Glasgow, for example, had already begun to move away from the junior-senior secondary division, and planned instead for the establishment of six-year comprehensive secondary schools, attended by children of all abilities. In the minds of most Scottish parents, the junior secondary had become a symbol of educational failure, with the majority of pupils leaving before the completion of their course. By 1955, similar dissatisfaction was reflected in the political manifesto of the Labour Party, which declared that "the ideal of a comprehensive educational system is part of the Scottish tradition."

Reform of the examination system in the early 1960s further facilitated the introduction of comprehensive education. In 1962, the Lower Leaving Certificate, available only in the senior secondary school, was replaced by the ordinary grade certificate. The new examination could be taken either in existing senior secondaries, or in any junior secondary which cared to provide the necessary fourth year of secondary education. Its introduction meant that the clearcut bipartite system disappeared, and outwith the city particularly, education authorities undertook a programme of creating four-year junior high schools. In Lanarkshire, in 1964, St. Mary's, Whifflet, St. Cuthbert's, Burnbank, and St. Aidan's, Wishaw, were all upgraded to become four-year secondaries, as, subsequently, were St. Joseph's, Motherwell, and St. Margaret's, Airdrie. Similarly, in the town of Paisley a two-tier system was created, by which junior high schools acted as feeders for the six-year senior high schools, such as St. Mirin's High School for boys, and St. Margaret's Convent for girls.

It could be argued therefore that the advent of the junior high school made relatively easy the transition from selective to comprehensive education, for although the two-tier system remained the basis for secondary education in Paisley, in other parts of Renfrewshire such as Greenock, and in Lanarkshire, the junior high schools were steadily upgraded to become full six-year comprehensives. John Ogilvie High School, (formerly St. Cuthbert's), Burnbank, achieved such status in 1973, as did Notre Dame High School, Greenock. In conjunction with the ordinary grade examination, the junior high schools also contributed to an increase in the number of pupils remaining at school beyond the normal leaving-age.

The full-scale introduction of comprehensive education was initiated by the return of a Labour Government in 1964. Barely a year later, in October 1965, Circular 600, issued by the Scottish Education Department, declared that henceforth the Scottish educational system would be comprehensive in nature, and local authorities were invited to submit schemes for bringing the decision into effect. In areas such as Glasgow, where the policy had already been anticipated, the changeover to the comprehensive system was virtually complete by the early 1970s. For the Catholic community, the effects of the new system were likely to prove significant, as it contributed to a more rapid expansion than might otherwise have been possible, in the number of Catholic schools providing the full secondary course. Large junior secondaries were reorganised as comprehensives, while their smaller counterparts either reverted to primary status, or closed.

Improved educational opportunities for Catholics however, could not be effected solely by the provision of the necessary secondary places, for the persistent shortage of teachers acted as one factor inhibiting development. The most serious shortages occurred in mathematics, science, homecraft, and physical education, but many schools also found it difficult to recruit teachers of English, music, history, geography, commerce and art. Mathematics was particularly badly served, for, with only a very meagre supply of honours graduates entering the teaching profession, it was difficult to find suitable candidates for appointment as heads of department, a situation which boded ill for the future development of the subject, particularly in the early 1960s when the work of the Nuffield Foundation contributed to the introduction of an alternative syllabus not only in mathematics, but also in science. Moreover, the division of science into its component parts - physics, chemistry, and biology - itself created a need for more specialist teachers. The new Scottish Certificate of Education from the 1960s onwards, also promoted an increase in the number of separate subjects, with new courses such as 'modern studies' being introduced.

In attempting to attract the necessary specialist teachers, education had to compete with the attractions of industry and commerce, and with posts in the scientific and civil service, all of which absorbed increasing numbers of graduates direct from university. Graduate recruitment into the teaching profession in the mid-1950s was only forty per cent of the figure a quarter of a century earlier. For Catholic schools, which drew upon non-Catholic specialists to make up shortfalls in specific subjects, such a reduction in graduate entrants into teaching could only extend the period of staffing difficulty. In addition, increasing "wastage" rates among young woman teachers, in part due to earlier marriage, became a source of concern. Of those female students who had completed their training between 1959 and 1963, almost one quarter (25%) were no longer teaching by the latter date. Thus, although Notre Dame College of Education over the same period trained 648 female teachers, 484 with the primary, and 164 with the secondary, qualification, it could reasonably be expected that a substantial number of these would leave the profession within a few years. Nor, at least in the 1960s, could male entrants to teaching have compensated for such losses, for, in 1962, they comprised only 17 per cent of the training colleges' total intake. Such difficulties in teacher supply led education authorities to employ increasing numbers of retired and uncertificated teachers, with some staff aged more than seventy being re-employed. In 1962, it was estimated that to fill vacancies, reduce over-size classes, and replace the teachers aged over seventy, would require an additional 3,739 teachers, a figure which had risen by 1966, to 5,000. As a result, a national campaign was launched to persuade married women to return to the profession, particularly to relieve shortages in the primary schools. Though by 1972, the staffing position in Catholic schools had improved - assisted by a fall in the birth-rate, and by the arrival within the teaching profession of some of the beneficiaries of the post-war expansion of secondary education - the raising of the school-leaving age to sixteen in 1972 tended to offset any increase in teacher supply. "As relatively fewer pupils in Roman Catholic schools formerly remained at school after the age of fifteen these schools tended to be more affected by the raising of the leaving-age." Further, though 'the increase in the number of [Catholic] teachers...was proportionately greater than in non-denominational schools the number of [Catholic] pupils increased still faster”. As a result, though staffing shortages continued to afflict non-denominational schools as well, Catholic pupil-teacher ratios remained comparatively high.

In an attempt to effect some improvement, authorities drew upon the Scottish Education Department's designated area schemes of 1967 and 1971 which targeted resources to areas of greatest need. Under both schemes, supplements to salary were made to induce teachers to apply for posts in the most seriously understaffed schools. The national total of posts covered by the scheme, 3,785 in 1967 and 4,565 in 1971 - were allocated to education authorities under a quota system based on each authority's share of the most seriously understaffed schools. The largest shares of the posts available went to Glasgow, Lanarkshire, and Renfrewshire. Indeed, in 1971, these three counties alone accounted for 85% of the allocation. Each authority was then invited to select schools, both primary and secondary, for designation within its quota. As staffing ratios for Catholic schools were "manifestly not as satisfactory as for non-denominational schools," the Catholic community benefitted disproportionately from such incentives. Indeed, the operation of the 1971 scheme in Glasgow was deliberately weighted in favour of Catholic schools by designating no fewer than fifteen of their nineteen secondary schools, all of which had pupil-teacher ratios in excess of the highest figure (18:1) recorded in non-denominational schools. Indeed, nine out of the fifteen had ratios of 20:1 and over. With recruitment of secondary teachers, particularly for Catholic schools, now being Glasgow's "highest staffing priority" primary schools were excluded from the 1971 scheme.

The success of the first designation scheme, under which designated schools improved their staffing position in comparison with non-designated schools, boded well for the impact of its successor. However, even in the early 1970s, the Catholic community faced continuing difficulties in supplying the necessary teachers, particularly from its own resources. In Ayrshire, of four secondary schools significantly understaffed in relation to their size, three were Roman Catholic. Dunbartonshire and Renfrewshire both reported staffing imbalances between non-denominational and Roman Catholic secondary schools; imbalances which affected both the school as a whole and individual subject departments. The need in times of general shortage to recruit all teachers irrespective of the specialisms professed, could produce imbalances between subjects, even in schools with apparently acceptable pupil-teacher ratios. Furthermore, concerning Renfrewshire, it was suggested that Roman Catholic schools produced "proportionately fewer pupils with entry qualifications for higher education than do non-denominational schools;" while in Glasgow the staffing complements in Catholic schools made it "very difficult...to produce pupils with the potential to become teachers," particularly in areas of continuing shortage such as mathematics, art, and technical subjects. Promoted posts, such as principal teachers and above, remained especially vulnerable to staffing difficulties. Even so, Glasgow was reluctant to appoint non-Catholic staff to such duties, a policy supported by the Catholic hierarchy which desired to ensure the religious character of the schools.

Even so, broader educational developments also exerted considerable influence upon the Church's ability to provide for the religious training of Catholic children. Curricular changes, and the need to alter timetables to accommodate other disciplines, could mean a downgrading in importance for the religious knowledge period. Further, the rapid expansion of secondary education, and the related staffing shortages, led to the abandonment in the mid-1960s of the Prospective Teachers religious certificate examination. Originally geared towards the aspirations and abilities of the relatively small number of Catholic Higher grade candidates, it became both unsuitable and unwieldy in an era of secondary education for all. Nor, with their continued acceptance of the need for non-Catholic and uncertificated teachers, could Catholic schools assume that every member of staff would be willing or able to undertake religious instruction.

An awareness of such difficulties led in the early 1970s to the appointment of full-time secondary school chaplains, and the provision of religious education centres to provide resources for both clergy and teachers. Such efforts further demonstrate the Church's desire to maintain the religious character of the schools. Nevertheless, with its schools now both financed and controlled by Scotland's county burghs and councils, the Church's responsibilities had radically altered. Its role had become what Canon Kelly had always desired it should be, namely spiritual and pastoral rather than administrative - a pastor rather than a school manager.